
Council

10 July 2018

Name of Cabinet Member:

Cabinet Member for Strategic Finances and Resources – Councillor J Mutton

Director Approving Submission of the report:

Deputy Chief Executive (People)

Ward(s) affected:

Not applicable

Title:

Workforce Strategy: Review of Employee Car Parking Arrangements

Is this a key decision?

No

Executive Summary:

This report proposes a revised Business Car Parking pass policy and a new Workplace Parking scheme, which would be available to all city centre based employees. The Workplace Parking scheme would replace the current Trade Union parking arrangements.

At present, car parking costs for employees working within the city centre are reimbursed on an inconsistent basis. There are a range of historical reasons for the allocation of duty car parking passes that are no longer appropriate. The current Trade Union membership scheme offers a subsidised parking to Trade Union members only.

Recommendations:

Council is recommended to:

1. Adopt the revised policy of eligibility criteria for Car Parking Duty passes (as per appendix A); and

2. Introduce a subsidised Workplace Parking Scheme and withdraw the Trade Union Membership subsidised parking scheme.

List of Appendices included:

Appendix A – Draft Business Pass Car Parking Policy

Appendix B – Equality and Consultation Part 1 and 2

Background papers:

There are no background papers.

Other useful documents

There are no other documents.

Has it been or will it be considered by Scrutiny?

No

Has it been or will it be considered by any other Council Committee, Advisory Panel or other body?

No

Will this report go to Council?

Yes – July 10th 2018.

Report title: Workforce Strategy & Reform - Review of Car Park Passes

1. Context (or background)

- 1.1 The overarching rationale for the proposed changes is to ensure:
- That internal car parking charges are brought into a more controlled environment and are based entirely on business need;
 - There is more control over council car parking assets, ensuring space is used to maximise income;
 - More flexibility for parking services to manage capacity and maximise revenue; and
 - Support of the promotion of green travel and encourage the use of public transport and bicycles.
- 1.2 Currently, there are approximately 850 'live' car parking duty passes, and a further 129 Trade Union car parking scheme members. The Council is currently subsidising this scheme at a cost of circa £86,146 per annum. Although the Council's workforce population has decreased, the number of internal duty passes has not. The application of the existing policy has been inconsistent.

2. Options considered and recommended proposals

- 2.1 A number of options were also considered as part of the review. These have not been put forward as recommendations.
- **Do nothing** – and enforce the existing policy. Whilst this would ensure parking arrangement were brought into a more controlled environment, analysis and feedback from employees and service areas indicates that the existing policy no longer reflects business need. There would be a risk that enforcement of the existing criteria would leave many who need a duty pass (who undertake frequent but short visits across the city, less than 50 miles) not eligible for a pass.
 - **Remove all duty passes** – this option is not reflective of business need; employees who need to regularly use a number of city centre car parks would be entitled to claim car parking expenses incurred as part of fulfilling their role. It is deemed more cost effective to issue a duty/business pass and this would undoubtedly maintain service productivity and be more administratively efficient.
 - **Retain the subsidised Trade Union Membership scheme** – as the scheme is not accessible to all city centre based staff and represents a loss of income to the council, it is not recommended that we keep the scheme. The introduction of a Workplace Parking Scheme to replace the Trade

Union Membership scheme will be accessible to all city centre based employees. There is also provides an opportunity to generate an income for the Council.

2.2 The following recommendations are proposed in order to achieve the outcomes outlined in section 1.1;

- Update the policy of eligibility criteria for the allocation of city centre car park passes in order to better reflect business need; and
- Withdrawal of the Trade Union Membership Scheme and introduction of a Workplace Parking scheme for city centre based employees.

2.3 Car Parking Duty Pass Changes

2.3.1 It is proposed that the policy of eligibility criteria for Car Parking Duty passes is revised in order to ensure that they are allocated to those who have a business need to use city centre car parks. Consultation and discussion with employees, including senior managers, provides evidence that future criteria should be based on a verified need to frequently use city centre car parks on council business as opposed to miles travelled.

The revised policy criteria being proposed is attached at Appendix A.

2.3.2 A number of measures are also proposed to ensure that identification and allocation of duty passes is transparent, consistent and regularly monitored.

2.3.3 A 'business' car park pass will be issued following evaluation and approval by the manager (appropriate line manager). The process for identifying who is eligible for a pass following agreement of proposed criteria will include peer challenge and verification by Corporate Leadership Team (directors). Frontline employees will also be involved in the verification process. Tight controls will be put in place to ensure a robust process is effectively managed including audit and annual review.

2.4 Trade Union Membership Scheme

2.4.1 It is proposed the current Trade Union membership Parking Scheme is withdrawn and replaced with the Workplace Parking scheme below.

2.5 Workplace Parking Scheme

2.5.1 It is proposed that a Workplace Parking scheme is introduced, open to all council employees who work in the city centre at a cost of £600 per annum.

- 2.5.2 The proposed scheme would allow employees to park in a number of city centre car parks. The car parks that have been identified for the scheme are New Union Street, Grosvenor Road, Cheylesmore, Moat Street and Manor House Drive. Gosford Street and Grove Street can be included in the offer if demand is high. Scheme membership costs would be deducted from employees' salaries on a monthly basis.

3. Results of consultation undertaken

3.1 Trade Union Involvement

- 3.1.1 Formal consultation with Trade Unions regarding the proposed changes took place 22nd March 2018 to 18th May 2018. During the consultation period, 4 formal meetings were held with Trade Union colleagues to discuss proposals. Trade Union colleagues asked for clarification/further information on a number of points and responses were provided.
- i) Initial duty pass criteria proposed was vague and subjective; the proposed criteria have been amended in response to this in order to ensure objectivity in application. This will be transparently applied with senior management oversight.
 - ii) Challenges to the financial assumptions and likelihood of making savings via the proposal; as discussed below, the savings target is based on a likely reduction in the internal recharge for duty passes and the subsequent creation of additional capacity within city centre car parks and therefore the opportunity for Car Parking Services to generate additional income.
 - iii) Changes could lead to a loss of goodwill from employees; duty pass changes have been developed to ensure that those that need a duty pass to undertake their duties will be eligible for a pass. Fairer criteria and ensuring transparent application of changes seek to limit the loss of goodwill. However, there will be employees who are impacted by proposed changes, both to the duty pass and withdrawal of the Trade Union Membership scheme. The Workplace Parking scheme should provide mitigation and alternate options. It must also be remembered, that the large numbers of city centre employees already make their own arrangements to travel/park to attend work.

3.2 Employee Engagement

- 3.2.1 Engagement has taken place with the Council's workforce, the Council's Senior Management Board, Corporate Leadership Team and management teams. A

range of communications have been used to encourage feedback including 2 'drop-in' sessions. Employees made a number of suggestions, which have been used to refine final proposals.

- 3.2.2 During the employee feedback period, more than 300 electronic responses were received from employees. Although some individuals made more than one comment, several comments were received on behalf of whole teams and so the total number of people to have provided feedback would be higher. In addition, 53 employees attended the drop-in sessions, and 10 comments were captured from the intranet.
- 3.2.3 The majority of responses (87%) received were from employees who have either a duty pass or access the Trade Union membership scheme. Employees with a pass comprise 15% of the city centre based workforce. The greatest volume of replies were received from the following areas;
- Social care (Adults & Children's)
 - Place (Property, Development, Enforcement etc.)
 - Corporate functions (Finance, HR, etc.)
 - Education, libraries, etc.
- 3.2.4 Themes from employee feedback include:
- i) Social worker requirements – many comments point out the unpredictable and mobile nature of social work. Many believe that a parking pass is a prerequisite of doing their job well, but they are not sure that they would qualify for the duty pass under the details released so far. Some mentioned concerns for their safety if they were not able to use their own car.
 - ii) Specific circumstances – many specific examples have been given where the employee is mobile and frequently out of the office but is concerned that they would not meet the proposed criteria. These include employees who carry out inspections, provide repairs or technical support across the city, or transport equipment in their personal cars. Some mention the need to leave work in an emergency and therefore the reason that they bring the car every day. A number of responses also mention individual circumstances such as commutes and caring responsibilities.
 - iii) Cost is too high – many felt that the proposed cost of the new workplace parking scheme was too high. A revised cost of £600 per annum has now been suggested.
- 3.2.5 Despite the fact that many of the responses were from employees who currently have a car park pass, the 4th highest identified feedback theme was general support for the review. Supportive comments cited the lack of fairness

under the current arrangements and the fact that prices have not risen over previous years. Others noted that flexible working arrangements and new technology allowed them to work more remotely, and that continuing this trend would mean less reliance on car parking in future.

4. Timetable for implementing this decision

- 4.1** An outline implementation plan is provided below. Detailed project and communications plans will be developed to ensure that timescales are met and that those affected are appropriately communicated with.

Implementation

Business (Duty) Pass Changes

- Managers to identify/approve who will be eligible for a pass – Summer 2018
- Employees receive decision regarding eligibility for a pass – Summer 2018
- Implement revised arrangements – Autumn 2018

Replace the Trade Union Membership Scheme with Workplace Parking Scheme

- Notification to employees Summer 2018
- Launch Workplace Parking Scheme – Summer 2018
- Withdraw Trade Union Membership Scheme - Early 2019

5. Comments from the Director of Finance and Corporate Services

5.1 Financial implications

- 5.1.1** The financial case behind the proposal for changes to employee parking is based on the fact that the existing criteria are no longer reflective of business need and therefore there is likely to be a reduction in the number allocated to employees under new proposals. This results in utilisation of valuable Council car park capacity and an inability to earn any income from these spaces. The Council is looking for ways to reduce its costs or earn more income, therefore it is not sustainable to continue to provide free or subsidised parking.
- 5.1.2** Both of the existing schemes represent a loss of income to the council. Where car park passes are issued to departments there is a car park pass expenditure budget with an equal and opposite income budget within Parking Services. Should recommendations be adopted these existing budgets will be removed, and they will be replaced with a new budget for newly issued passes meeting

the defined criteria. An additional income target budget of £300k will also be created within parking services to be met from either new external income or the new workplace parking scheme. Achievement of the additional income target will clearly be dependent on take up of the scheme and the extent to which the spare parking capacity is utilised. We will continue to keep achievement of the income target for parking under review following the implementation of the new arrangements.

5.2 Legal implications

The legal view is that neither individual passes nor the trade union scheme have in general been incorporated into the Council's employment contracts. If further evidence emerges concerning the employment contracts of a limited number of individual employees, their personal circumstances can be dealt with on a case by case basis.

5.3 Other implications

There are no other implications.

6.1 How will this contribute to the Council Plan

- 6.1.1 This review will support the Council Plan 2016- 2024 in delivering our priorities, with fewer resources by making the most of our car parking assets.

6.2 How is risk being managed?

- 6.2.1 Changes to our Car Parking arrangements are being managed within a project management environment, including a dynamic risk register. The project forms part of the Workforce Reform Programme which is governed by a programme board and closely monitored via Corporate Leadership Team and Senior Management Board. The main project management risks is a low financial risk of not achieving the financial income because the new workplace parking scheme is not taken up in the numbers expected. This will be mitigated via increased car parking capacity available to the general public.

6.3 What is the impact on the organisation?

- 6.3.1 The changes proposed should ensure;
- That internal car parking charges are brought into a more controlled environment and are based entirely on business need;
 - There is more control over parking assets, ensuring space is used to maximise income;

- More flexibility for parking services to manage capacity and maximise revenue; and
- Support of the promotion of green travel and encourage the use of public transport and bicycles.

6.4 Equalities / EIA

- 6.4.1 An Equality and Consultation Analysis has been completed in relation to the proposals to revise eligibility criteria for duty passes; withdraw the Trade Union Membership parking scheme and to introduce a new work place parking scheme for city centre based employees. If implemented these proposals could potentially have a negative impact on part-time female employees who currently purchase a pass as part of the Trade Union membership scheme. However, the impact is not disproportionate given the overall number of part-time female employees employed within the organisation who do not currently access the scheme.
- 6.4.2 The review of the eligibility criteria should have a positive impact across council employees as it should ensure that only those eligible for a pass will continue to receive one and will be applied at all levels throughout the organisation.

The Equality and Consultation Analysis Part 1 and 2 is attached at Appendix B.

6.5 Implications for (or impact on) the environment

- 6.5.1 The revised scheme should have a beneficial impact upon the environment, including air quality, as it is likely to result in fewer people routinely driving to work in central Coventry. The new office at Friargate is well located for those travelling to work by public transport (rail and bus), and those walking or cycling, and pool cars are available for those needing to travel by car on business on an intermittent basis. Some of the pool cars are electric / hybrid vehicles, which further support the Council's air quality objectives. Staff also have access to pool bikes and public transport tickets for work travel. The revised scheme will therefore complement these measures and reduce the need for staff to drive to work.

6.6 Implications for partner organisations?

- 6.6.1 There are no implications for partner organisations.

Report author(s):

Contributor/approver name	Title	Directorate or organisation	Date doc sent out	Date response received or approved
Contributors:				
Suzanne Bennett	Governance Services Officer	Place	8/6/2018	11/6/2018
Liz Gaulton	Director of Health & Well Being (Board Member Workforce Strategy)	People	8/6/2018	11/6/2018
Barbara Barrett	Head of Human resources and Organisational Development	People	8/6/2018	26/6/2018
Michelle McGinty	Head of Programme Delivery	People	8/6/2018	14/6/2018
Colin Knight	Director of Transportation and Highways	Place	27/6/2018	28/6/2018
John Seddon	Head of Transport and Innovation	Place	24/6/2018	25/6/2018
Finance: Ewan Dewar	Finance Manager	Place	8/6/2018	13/6/2018
Legal: Gill Carter	Regulatory Team Leader	Place	8/6/2018	13/6/2018
Names of approvers for submission: (officers and members)				
Finance: Barry Hastie	Director of Finance and Corporate Resources	Place	8/6/2018	28/6/2018
Legal: Julie Newman	Head of Legal Services	Place	8/6/2018	28/6/2018
Director: David Ashmore	Director of Customer Services and Transformation	People	8/6/2018	27/6/2018
Deputy Chief	Deputy Chief Executive	People	28/6/2018	28/6/2018

Executive: Gail Quinton	(People)			
Members: Cllr John Mutton	Cabinet Member for Strategic Finance and Resources		27/6/2018	28/6/2018

Name and job title: David Ashmore, Director of Transformation and Customer Services

Directorate: People

Tel and email contact: david.ashmore@coventry.gov.uk, 024 7683 2884

Enquiries should be directed to the above person.

This report is published on the council's website:
www.coventry.gov.uk/councilmeetings

Appendices

Appendix A

Business Car Parking Passes

XX 2018

Some roles require employees to drive in and out of the city centre on a frequent basis in order to carry out their role efficiently.

- 1). Business Car Parking passes will be issued when;
 - i. There is no suitable alternative in order to enable the employee to do their job effectively;
 - Other options such as public transport and/or pool cars are not sufficient; **and**
 - A duty pass is the most cost effective option. (That is to reimburse car parking fees incurred on an as and when basis across the city centre would on average amount to more than £1200 per annum. This would equate to needing City Centre Car Parking approximately 7 times per week)

AND

- ii. Employees meet the following criteria:
 - They are based in the city centre and need to travel within and/or outside of the city centre and in and out of car parks on most working days in order to perform their duties; **and/or**
 - They are based in the city centre and may need to frequently leave their place of work to carry out their duties at short notice.
2. In allowing free car parking for employees in public car parks, the City Council's policy is that this must not be done to the detriment of the public, commercial and shopping car parking needs of the City Centre and employee parking is therefore restricted to ensure, as far as possible, that this policy is adhered to.
3. All business car park passes are issued in accordance with the criteria laid down in the Conditions of Issue and the City Council's Car Parking regulations which includes the clause that 'the Council shall not be responsible for any loss or damage to any motor vehicle or to any property contained in the motor vehicles from any cause by the Council's own negligence, whilst entering, within, or leaving the car park'.

4. Future issuing of car park passes is subject to an annual review and it must be clear where any are issues, it is not a contractual requirement and may be withdrawn at any time.
5. Managers are responsible for authorisation of car park passes in accordance with criteria in paragraph 1.
6. **Administrative Procedure for obtaining Business Car Parking Passes**

6.1 Business Car Parking Passes and Conditions of Issue

- The application form can be accessed online at XXX
- The application must be completed in full, signed by the manager/budget holder and include the budget code to be charged.
- It is the manager's responsibility to check that the employee's insurance policy covers business use, to check the driving licence and record the number on the form and also the MOT certificate where required. This must be done on the employees first day of work at the latest.
- The completed form will be sent to Parking Services online.
- The employee will be notified by email when the pass is ready to be collected. The employee, who will be required to sign to confirm that they have received the pass, must collect from XXXX, when directed.
- The employee will receive a copy and sign of the 'Conditions of Issue' with the pass.

6.2 Change of Vehicle

- If an employee changes their vehicle, which is registered against the pass, the Car Park Office must be notified. This will enable the Car Park Office to get in touch with the owner regarding the vehicle in an emergency.

6.3 Employee leaves the Council

- When an employee leaves the Council, the employee and the manager must ensure that the Business Car Park Pass is returned on the last day of use.
- The manager must ensure the Car Parking office is informed and that the Pass is returned to them/deactivated.
- The manager will continue to be charged for the pass until it is received by the Car Parking Office, it is very important therefore that the pass is returned immediately the employee leaves.

- If the employee does not return the pass, the manager should inform Employment Services immediately. In the event of failure to surrender the pass, Employment Services, will withhold any final salary due which will indemnify the City Council against possible unauthorised use of the pass, subject to consent having been provided by the employee on the Duty Car Park Pass Application Form.

6.4 Transfer within the Council

- Business Car Park Passes relate to the post not to the employee. Therefore, if an employee transfers to another post in the council, a duty car park pass must be returned to the Car Park Office at the address in 6.1 when the employee leaves a post.
- If the new post requires a duty car park pass, a new one will be issued. Please note Duty Car Park Passes are NOT TRANSFERRABLE and it is the manager's responsibility to ensure the pass is returned when the holder no longer uses it. This is very important for budget control.

6.5 Car Park Passes no longer required/returned

- These can be returned to the Car Park Office where a refund will be paid for every full unused week until 31 March of that financial year.

For further information please contact the
HR Advice Line
TEL 76832454 opt 1
payroll.queries@coventry.gov.uk

Appendix B: Equality and Consultation Analysis Part 1 and 2

In line with the principles of decision making outlined in the City Council Constitution, the Council will ensure that its decision making is open and transparent, and that due regard is given to the Council's obligations and desire to promote equality of opportunity and equal treatment.

Form 1

This part must be completed and before formal consultation is undertaken and must be available during the consultation stage.

Author of this document: Denise Connolly

Name of Service Area/Proposal: Duty Car Park Pass – policy review

Head of Service: Barbara Barrett

Date of completion: 16th April 2018

Background to the planned changes

1. What is the background to the planned changes? Why is this change being considered?

Duty Pass arrangements are being reviewed as part of the Workforce Reform Programme. At present, car parking costs for employees working within the city centre are reimbursed on an inconsistent basis. There are also other historical reasons for the allocation of car parking passes that are no longer appropriate.

Baseline data from November 2017 used to inform the review shows that there are 849 'live' duty passes, of which

- 223 are assigned to agency employees or unnamed employees (e.g. 'pool pass where criteria cannot be assessed)
- 228 meet existing criteria (based on cross reference of mileage expense claim data)
- 398 employees do not meet existing criteria (based on cross reference of mileage claim data).

There are a further 128 Trade Union car parking scheme members. The Council is currently subsidising this scheme at a cost of £86,146 per year. Car parking is restricted to specific car parks.

In addition, there are 79 employees with access to the Magistrates car park. Usage data suggests 30 employees use this car park on a regular basis. Access to Magistrates' parking is due to end in the coming months as this property is now owned by Coventry University. Separate arrangements have been made with the university to provide spaces

for Councillors and for Full Council meetings. The date of this arrangement is to be confirmed.

Car Park pass holders in total account for 15% of the workforce. This is broken down as follows:

- Duty Pass Holders – 12% of total workforce
- Magistrates Pass Holders – 0.5% of the total workforce
- Trade Union Membership Pass Holders – 2.5%

There are currently 10 pool cars available to employees on a bookable basis. 8 of these are based at Friargate and 2 at Whitley depot. These support the green travel plan, there are plans to buy two more cars if needed within the current plans for Friargate.

Consultation took place with Trade Unions from 22nd March to 18th May 2018 and employees were invited to give feedback from 23rd March to 30th April on the following proposals:

- Revised eligibility criteria for Duty Passes
- Withdrawal of Trade Union subsidy from the council for reduced cost parking
- The introduction of a work place parking scheme for city centre employees

2. Who do you need to consider as part of this ECA? *stakeholder analysis

Current Duty Pass Holders

Magistrates Car Park Pass Holders

Trade Union Car Park Pass Holders

Trade Unions

Service Users who could be at risk if a social worker for example could not get to them quickly in case of an emergency.

Pre-Consultation Engagement

This section refers to any activities that took place (such as briefings, meetings, workshops, scoping exercises etc.) with stakeholders before the formal consultation period.

3. What engagement activities took place prior to formal consultation and what feedback (if any) was received in relation to equality issues?

3 Workshops were held with employees on May 25th 2017, May 31st 2017 and 2nd June 2017. These workshops were to engage employees and get their input into all aspects of the Workforce Reform programme. 164 employees attended and 1212 comments and ideas were gathered. Car parking was one of the themes discussed at the workshops. In terms of equalities the following themes were identified:

- The current system is unfair, need to be more transparent and consistent
- There is not enough parking for disabled employees at Friargate
- The Duty Passes should be prioritised in terms of post i.e. social workers

Discussions have also taken place with Trade Union colleagues to discuss all aspect of workforce reform – these discussions are ongoing.

Meetings are ongoing with Directors and Heads of Service to discuss needs in specific areas especially those dealing with vulnerable adults or children.

Analysis of Impact

In this section please ensure that you consider the three aims of the general duty as they affect **protected groups**. These groups are:

Age
Disability
Gender
Gender reassignment
Marriage/Civil Partnership
Pregnancy/Maternity
Race
Religion/Belief
Sexual Orientation

The **three aims of the general duty** require that a public authority, in the exercise of its functions, must have due regard to the need to:

1. Eliminate discrimination, harassment and victimisation
2. Advance equality of opportunity between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it
3. Foster good relations between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it

Note – when identifying potential impacts below, please only include impacts that may exist over and above general impacts that may affect the wider community/population. For example, a reduction in grant to Coventry Citizens Advice would affect all service users through a reduced level of first line advice being available to all – but it would affect the following groups more; age, disability, gender and race as they represent a larger proportion of the clients who use the advice service

Age

The table below looks at the percentage of employees by age bracket who hold a Duty pass, a trade union pass or a Magistrate's car park pass against the percentage of the council's whole workforce in that age bracket.

	16-24 (%)	25-34 (%)	35-44 (%)	45-54 (%)	55-64 (%)	64-74 (%)	75-84 (%)
Council Employees	4	15	21	31	25	3.5	0.5
Duty Pass Holders	4	13	21	38	21	2.5	0.5
Magistrates Pass Holders	0	7	20	43	30	0	0
Trade Union Membership Pass Holder	2	15	26	29	26	2	0

A higher percentage of people with Magistrate's car park passes are aged 45-54 and 55-64 when compared to with the Council workforce.

Disability

The table below looks at the percentage of employees with a disability who hold a Duty pass, a trade union pass or a Magistrate's car park pass against the percentage of the council's whole workforce.

	Have disability (%)	No disability (%)	Prefer not to say/ unknown (%)
Council Employees	5	74	21
Duty Pass Holders	6	77	17
Magistrates Pass Holders	3	70	27
Trade Union Membership Pass Holder	6	10	84

There is limited parking at Friargate for disabled employees. Blue badge holders can park in car parks in the city centre. Any employee who has specific parking requirements due to disability will continue to be assessed under the duty to make reasonable adjustments.

Gender

The table below looks at the percentage of employees by gender who hold a Duty pass, a trade union pass or a Magistrate's car park pass against the percentage of the council's whole workforce.

	Female	Male
Council Employees	69%	31%
Duty Pass Holders	65%	35%
Magistrates Pass Holders	81%	19%
Trade Union Membership Pass Holder	84%	16%

The Council employs significantly more female employees than male. This is reflected in the allocation of the passes. Trade Union Membership passes and Magistrates car park passes have a high allocation to female workers. It is likely that there will be a detrimental impact on this group.

Gender reassignment – no statistical information is available for this protected group.

Marriage/Civil Partnership – no statistical information is available around this protected group.

Pregnancy/Maternity – any adjustments required in terms of parking closer to an office is dealt with as part of the reasonable adjustments duty.

Race

The table below looks at the percentage of employees by race who hold a duty pass, a trade union pass or a Magistrates car park pass against the percentage of the council's whole workforce.

	Asian or Asian British (%)	Black or Black British (%)	Mixed race (%)	White or White British (%)	Other (%)	Unknown or prefer not to say (%)
Council Employees	10	4	1	66.5	0.5	18
Duty Pass Holders	10	5	2	69	0.5	13
Magistrate Pass Holders	0	0	0	80	0	20
Trade Union Member pass holder	12.5	2.5	1	77	0	7

There is a higher percentage of White or White British than the council average that have a Magistrates car park pass or a Trade Union Membership pass based on this data. There is also a higher percentage of people with a trade union pass who are Asian or Asian British when compared to the overall Council workforce and black or Black British

Religion/Belief – no statistical information is available around this protected group.

Sexual Orientation

The table below looks at the percentage of employees by sexual orientation who hold a duty pass, a trade union pass or a Magistrate's car park pass against the percentage of the council's whole workforce.

	Lesbian, gay (%)	Heterosexual (%)	Bisexual (%)	Other (%)	Unknown, Prefer not to say (%)
Council Employees	1	36	0.5	0.5	62
Duty pass Holders	0.5	46	0.5	0.5	53
Magistrates Pass Holder	0	50	0	0	49
Trade Union Membership pass holder	1	50	0	0	50

Due to the high number of people who prefer not to state their sexual orientation it is difficult to see if there is any significant impact.

- 4. Outline below how this proposal/review could impact on protected groups positively or negatively, and what steps/mitigations (if any) could be taken to reduce any negative impact that has been identified.**

The council employs more female than male employees – this is reflected in the allocation of Duty Passes. However, Trade Union Membership passes and Magistrates passes have a high allocation to female workers. It is likely that there will be a detrimental impact on this small group of employees.

- 5. Are there any other vulnerable groups that could be affected? i.e. deprivation, looked after children, carers.**

Approximately 41% of duty passes are currently allocated to Social work teams across Adults and Children's services. Consideration will need to be given to making sure the revised policy does not have a detrimental impact on vulnerable adults or children within the city or on those who have been placed outside of the city.

Grade Analysis

The table below looks at the percentage of employees by grade who hold a duty pass, a trade union pass or a Magistrates car park pass against the percentage of the council's whole workforce.

	G1 (%)	G2 (%)	G3 (%)	G4 (%)	G5 (%)	G6 (%)	G7 (%)	G8 (%)	G9 (%)	G10 (%)	SM 1-3	Other
Council Employees	4	7	23	15	14	9	9	5	3	1	1	9
Duty Pass Holders	0	0	0.5	2	18	15	27	14	10	3	4	6.5
Magistrates Pass Holders	0	0	10	0	3	7	3	10	3	0	23	41
Trade Union Membership Scheme	0	2	21	32	11	17	7	5	2	0	0	3

81% of Trade Union Passes are purchased by female employees – this consists of:

- 27 Grade 3 employees - 25 of whom are female
- 41 Grade 4 employees – 36 of whom are female
- 14 Grade 5 employees – 11 of whom are female

Of the 81% of females in the scheme, 66% work part-time or term time only.

Health Inequalities

Also include any information about the health inequalities/Marmot implications of this proposal. Contact Caroline Ryder () or Hannah Watts (hannah.watts@coventry.gov.uk) in Public Health for more information.

Public Health colleagues have advised that this question does not apply for these recommendations.

6. What are the gaps in evidence? Can this be addressed during the consultation stage?

The analysis is based on November 2017 baseline data so will be slightly out of date. Once a revised criteria has been agreed we will need to look at the updated data and the list of who will be eligible for a pass to see the real impact and assess whether there are any mitigating actions that need to be undertaken.

7. What are the likely impacts of this project/review on staff from protected groups?

For further support please contact Andy Hyland (andy.hyland@coventry.gov.uk Tel: 7683 3426)

The revised eligibility criteria will have a positive impact on the workforce as a whole as it will take away the historical unfairness whereby employees who do not require a duty pass have been allocated them, or have had them passed on by former employees.

There could potentially be a negative impact against some part-time female workers as the proposals to introduce a new duty pass can only be purchased for the full week. This will have a bigger cost implication to part-time workers especially those on lower pay scales.

Form 2

This section should be completed AFTER any consultation has been concluded.

Author of this document: Denise Connolly

Date of completion: 18th May 2017

Potential Impacts – further information

- 8. Referring to the information detailed in question 4 of ECA Form 1, state if the potential impacts have been confirmed. Also detail below any additional information about potential impacts that has been highlighted during any consultation.**

Formal consultation with Trade Unions took place from 23rd March to 22nd April, this was extended to 30th April and again to 18th May 2018 at the request of the Trade Unions. At the same time feedback was sought from employees. Over 300 e-mails were received and over 50 employees attended drop-in sessions. Most of the feedback was from employees holding trade union membership scheme passes or duty passes or their managers.

Whist Unions were not in favour of the review of the eligibility criteria for duty passes or the withdrawal of the Trade Union Membership Scheme there were no concerns raised around equality for any groups with protected characteristics.

Concerns raised by employees in terms of equalities include the following which support the assessment outlined in part 1:

Gender

A high number of respondents felt that the cost of the new city centre parking was too high. In terms of protected groups feedback from those who have purchased a pass under the Trade Union Membership scheme felt that this would have a bigger impact on part-time employees in term of cost as the suggested price of £55 a month was more than double the £25 they currently pay, with no part time option available. This feedback reflects the finding in part 1 of the ECA.

It is not possible at the moment to offer a part-time pass as this would cause significant administrative and enforcement difficulties. We are still looking to see if there are any options that could be put into place to support this small number of employees.

Disability

A number of concerns were expressed over the lack of Blue Badge parking spaces in or near to Friargate which does not form part of this review. Non-blue badge holders with a disability will continue to be reviewed under the council's duty to make reasonable adjustments.

A number of employees working in social work roles also felt that if they had to rely on pool cars or public transport rather than use their own vehicles that vulnerable service users would be at risk. It would take longer to get to them in case of an emergency and if they had to return a car or use the bus that they would have time pressures and not be able to stay with the vulnerable person until the crisis was resolved.

No further impact has been identified.

Outcome of equality impact

9. Indicate which of the following best describes the equality impact of this project/review:

There will be **no** equality impact if the proposed option is implemented ☐

There will be **positive** equality impact if the proposed option is implemented ☐

There will be **negative** equality impact if the proposed option is implemented but this can be objectively justified ☐

There will be both **positive and negative** impacts if the proposed option is implemented ☒

Summary of ECA

Write a paragraph below which summarises the key aspects of this ECA.

This paragraph should be included in the Equalities/EIA section of any Cabinet/Cabinet Member Report.

This ECA relates to the proposals to revise eligibility criteria for duty passes; withdraw the Trade Union Membership parking scheme and to introduce a new work place parking scheme for city centre based employees. If implemented these proposals could potentially have a negative impact on part-time female employees, particularly those who currently purchase a pass as part of the Trade Union scheme. The impact is not disproportional.

The review of the current eligibility criteria could have a positive impact across council employees as only those eligible for a pass will continue to receive one.

Approvals from Director and Cabinet Member

Name of ECA Author: Denise Connolly

Date:

Director: David Ashmore, Director of Customer Services
and Transformation

Cabinet Member:

Please detail below any committees, boards or panels that have considered this analysis.

Name

Date

Chair

Decision taken

Next steps

Please send this completed ECA to the Insight Team as follows:

Wendy Ohandjanian (wendy.ohandjanian@coventry.gov.uk tel. 7683 2939)

Jaspal Mann (jaspal.mann@coventry.gov.uk tel. 7683 3112)